From: Cournoyer, Patrick [Patrick.Cournoyer@fda.hhs.gov]

**Sent**: 10/6/2017 2:18:30 PM

To: Al Khaldi, Sufian [Sufian.AlKhaldi@fda.hhs.gov]; Alewynse, Michaela G [Mika.Alewynse@fda.hhs.gov]; Baker, Jeffrey

[Jeffrey.Baker@fda.hhs.gov]; Blumkemelor, Donna [Donna.Blumkemelor@fda.hhs.gov]; Bonnette, Richard

[Richard.Bonnette@fda.hhs.gov]; Bouri, Khaled [Khaled.Bouri@fda.hhs.gov]; Carlson, Susan [Susan.Carlson@fda.hhs.gov]; Tracy Chen [tracy.chen@fda.hhs.gov]; Choudhuri, Supratim

[Supratim.Choudhuri@fda.hhs.gov]; Christensen, Rial [Rial.Christensen@fda.hhs.gov]; Dietz, Jason

[Jason.Dietz@fda.hhs.gov]; Ditto, Mary D [Mary.Ditto@fda.hhs.gov]; Edwards, David [David.Edwards@fda.hhs.gov];

Epstein, Laura [Laura.Epstein@fda.hhs.gov]; Etkins, Jeanne [Jeanne.Etkins@fda.hhs.gov]; Fasano, Jeremiah

[Jeremiah.Fasano@fda.hhs.gov]; Flamm, Eric [Eric.Flamm@fda.hhs.gov]; Hatwell, Karen [Karen.Hatwell@fda.hhs.gov]; Heintz, Kasey [Kasey.Heintz@fda.hhs.gov]; Jones, Kathleen [Kathleen.Jones@fda.hhs.gov]; Kahl, Linda S [Linda.Kahl@fda.hhs.gov]; Kaneko, Kotaro

[Kathleen.Jones@fda.hhs.gov]; Kahl, Linda S [Linda.Kahl@fda.hhs.gov]; Kaneko, Kotaro [Kotaro.Kaneko@fda.hhs.gov]; Keefe, Dennis M [Dennis.Keefe@fda.hhs.gov]; Kotewicz, Michael L [Michael.Kotewicz@fda.hhs.gov]; Krause, Andrea [Andrea.Krause@fda.hhs.gov]; Lacana, Emanuela [Emanuela.Lacana@fda.hhs.gov]; Linden, Carol [Carol.Linden@fda.hhs.gov]; Lombardi, Heather [Heather.Lombardi@fda.hhs.gov]; Manseur, Amal [Amal.Manseur@fda.hhs.gov]; Mattia, Antonia [Antonia.Mattia@fda.hhs.gov]; McMahon, Carrie [Carrie.McMahon@fda.hhs.gov]; Mendrick, Donna [Donna.Mendrick@fda.hhs.gov]; Merker, Robert I [Robert.Merker@fda.hhs.gov]; Morgan, Michael [Michael.Morgan@fda.hhs.gov]; Mukherjee, Amit [Amit.Mukherjee@fda.hhs.gov]; Nalubola, Ritu [Ritu.Nalubola@fda.hhs.gov]; Ostroff, Stephen [Stephen.Ostroff@fda.hhs.gov]; Pillsbury, Laura [Laura.Pillsbury@fda.hhs.gov]; Read, Jeffrey [Jeffrey.Read@fda.hhs.gov]; Ronnenberg, William [William.Ronnenberg@fda.hhs.gov]; Rose, Diane [Diane.Rose@fda.hhs.gov]; Rosenfeld, Leah [Leah.Rosenfeld@fda.hhs.gov]; Rudenko, Larisa [Larisa.Rudenko@fda.hhs.gov]; Shah, Romina [Romina.Shah@fda.hhs.gov]; Shaheed, Shaila [Shaila.Shaheed@fda.hhs.gov]; Srinivasan, Jannavi

[Jannavi.Srinivasan@fda.hhs.gov]; Thomas, Audrey A [Audrey.Thomas@fda.hhs.gov]; Wafula, Denis

[Denis.Wafula@fda.hhs.gov]; Weichold, Frank [Frank.Weichold@fda.hhs.gov]; Wilson, Carolyn [Carolyn.Wilson@fda.hhs.gov]; Zhu, Jianmei [Jianmei.Zhu@fda.hhs.gov]

Subject: GE News & Science

It's back! After two months of frequent travel and competing demands, I hope to continue sending Friday reports on a regular basis.

#### **NEWS**

#### In August, FDA approved the first gene therapy treatment in the US

• The treatment, called Kymriah, involves removing T cells from leukemia patients and engineering them to attack cancer cells

Science: Modified T cells that attack leukemia become first gene therapy approved in the United States

#### Syngenta settles with farmers for \$1.5B, but grain traders still seeking damages

- Farmers and grain traders have sought compensation from Syngenta for a drop in corn price after China stopped importing US corn, because it discovered Syngenta's not-yet-approved Agrisure Viptera trait in US exports
- Before the settlement, Syngenta faced state-by-state class action lawsuits from farmers
- Trial for the Cargill and ADM suit is set to begin in September 2018

Reuters: ADM, Cargill still pursue Syngenta over China GMO corn rejections

#### GE fish quietly entered the market in Canada

- CBC reported that AquaBounty has already sold 5 tons of GE salmon in Canada without widespread public awareness
- Many major supermarket chains in Canada say they do not carry it, including Costco

## New York Times features Impossible Burger's interactions with FDA over recombinant soy leghemoglobin

- The soy protein, produced in recombinant yeast, mimics blood and gives the plant-based burger a more realistic appearance and taste
- The company used the FDA's generally recognized as safe (GRAS) notification program for food ingredients
- Advocacy groups obtained FDA documents on the company's initial submission to the agency through Freedom
  of Information requests
- The Times reports that FDA identified some shortcomings in the initial submission, and the company plans to resubmit an improved notice

New York Times: Impossible Burger's 'Secret Sauce' Highlights Challenges of Food Tech

## Feature in Reuters blames seed-driven improvements in productivity for grain surpluses and low prices

- The article discusses Monsanto's effort to breed early-maturing corn to enable production in higher latitudes
- "Some analysts say the firms have effectively innovated their way into a stubbornly oversupplied market."
- Low prices are thought to be driving the ongoing consolidation in the agriculture sector
- The current glut is also attributed to a food shortage and price spike in 2008, which prompted more farmers around the world to grow corn

Reuters: Special Report: Drowning in grain - How Big Ag sowed seeds of a profit-slashing glut

## New York Times features problems from herbicide drift related to dicamba tolerant, GE crops

- The article includes little new information
- Dicamba sprayed on tolerant crops is prone to drifting and damaging non-tolerant fields
- As a result, multiple states have taken steps to restrict use of dicamba
- Dicamba tolerant cotton and soy were planted on 25M acres this year

New York Times: Monsanto's weed killer, dicamba, divides farmers

## FDA publishes final guidance on FDA vs EPA oversight of mosquito-related products

- Mosquito products, including GE mosquitos, intended to function as pesticides will be regulated by EPA, whereas those meant to prevent disease will be regulated by FDA
- The Oxitec GE mosquito will now be handled by EPA

FDA: Clarification of FDA and EPA Jurisdiction Over Mosquito-Related Products ABC News (AP): Officials: GMO mosquitoes aren't 'drugs,' need EPA oversight

## Genome-edited camelina not regulated by USDA

- The camelina reportedly yields more oil to improve the crop's commercial viability
- The company Yield10 imparted the trait using CRISPR/Cas9

USDA/APHIS: Genome Edited Camelina Developed by CRISPR/Cas Technology

Capital Press: Gene-edited camelina cleared by USDA

## Genome-edited alfalfa not regulated by USDA

The alfalfa was developed using TALEN technology for improved nutritional quality

USDA/APHIS: Alfalfa with Improved Nutritional Quality Developed with TALEN Technology

#### Study completed on use of digital codes for GE food disclosure

- The study, conducted by Deloitte, was commissioned as part of USDA/AMS' efforts issue a regulation enacting GE food disclosure within a two-year period ending in July 2018
- The study found "significant, but manageable" challenges in the use of electronic codes

Food Navigator: Digital GMO disclosure faces significant but manageable challenges, USDA study

The Grocery Manufacturers Association (GMA) wants highly refined ingredients to be within the scope of USDA-enforced GE food disclosure requirements

- GMA's position applies to oils, sugar, sweeteners, and other highly refined ingredients derived from various GE crops that lack detectable GE material
- GMA cites consumer interest and transparency as motivators for its position

Food Navigator: GMA: GMO labeling should apply to high refined oils, sweeteners

## **COMMENTARY**

## Broad coalition of stakeholders, including US regulators, summarize outcome of January 2016 meeting on gene drives in insects

- The authors aimed to develop guidelines for use of gene drives in insects
- The authors emphasized the need for complementary "self-governance," "soft governance," and "federal governance"

Nature Biotechnology: Rules of the road for insect gene drive research and testing

Official Report: Policy and Regulatory Issues for Gene Drives in Insects

# Market analysist sees great value in GE crops with omega-3 oils, but thinks fermentation could ultimately outcompete GE crops

- The analyst thinks industrial fermentation will ultimately be the cheapest, most flexible way to replace fish oil for uses in aquaculture and dietary supplements
- Seed companies, grain traders, and other biotechnology companies are investing heavily in both GE plants and in microbes for omega-3 production

The Motley Fool: Why GMO Crops (Probably) Can't Compete for This \$22 Billion Ingredient Opportunity

#### NYU Medical School ethicists consider how and to what extent communities should decide on use of GE insects

- The authors use the GE diamondback moth and Oxitec's GE mosquito as case studies
- The authors conclude by emphasizing the need for pro-active community engagement

Nature Biotechnology: Ethical lessons from a tale of two genetically modified insects

## Morten Hedegaard Larsen of Aahrus University responds to Richard Flavell of Ceres, Inc.'s case for wider use of plant biotechnology

- Larsen thinks Flavell misses key points in his case that using plant biotechnology to improve lives is a moral imperative and that scrutiny of biotechnology should be strictly product-based
- Larsen thinks Flavell overstates his case for biotechnology by failing to emphasize food waste, and underestimates the need for transparency and the value of fostering societal buy-in
- Flavell responds to Larsen by reasserting the logic of product-based scrutiny

Nature Biotechnology (Flavell): Reply: Greener revolutions for all require transparency and diversity, not secrecy Nature Biotechnology (Larsen): Greener revolutions for all require transparency and diversity, not secrecy Nature Biotechnology (Flavell, original): Greener revolutions for all

#### SCIENCE

## Scientist use CRISPR-Cas9 to repair genetic defect in human embryos

- The study received a high level of media attention when it was published August 2<sup>nd</sup>, but *Science* published doubts about the work August 31<sup>st</sup> related to potential artifacts
- The CRISPR/Cas9 protein complex was microinjected into cells coordinated at S-phase to maximize efficiency
- Loci were corrected by homology-directed repair using the endogenous wild type allele as the template
- The project was a collaboration between scientists at the Salk Institute, Oregon Health & Science University, Seoul National University, and BGI in China

Nature: Correction of a pathogenic gene mutation in human embryos

Nature (news): At the heart of gene edits in human embryos

New York Times: In breakthrough, scientists edit a dangerous mutation from genes in human embryos

Science: Skepticism surfaces over CRISPR human embryo editing claims

# CRISPR-Cas9 used to develop genome-edited pigs entirely lacking porcine endogenous retroviruses (PERVs) for xenotransplantation

- The group, led by George Church, Luhan Yang, and the startup eGenesis, hopes to modify pigs to allow transplantation of organs to humans
- The study also confirmed that PERVs can infect and transfer to human cells, making it essential to remove all PERVs before xenotransplantation
- A 2015 study showed PERVs could be removed from a pig immortalized cell line, whereas this work removed all PERVs and generated whole pigs
- eGenesis announced it raised \$38M in startup funds in March 2017

Science: Inactivation of porcine endogenous retrovirus in pigs using CRISPR-Cas9

## Genetically engineered malaria resistance in mosquitoes has incidental gene drive characteristics

• The GE insects have changes in their microbiota and altered mating behaviors that promote the spread of the GE alleles in a population

Science: Changes in the microbiota cause genetically modified Anopheles to spread in a population Washington Post: Genetically modified approaches to fighting malaria succeed in new tests

## GE mosquito gut bacteria confer resistance to malaria and are inherited by subsequent generations

- While GE gut bacteria had already been engineered that could confer malaria resistance to mosquitoes, the bacteria were not passed on to future generations
- This bacterium inhabits mosquito ovaries and can spread to subsequent generations
- The bacteria secrete anti-malaria effector proteins

Science: <u>Driving mosquito refractoriness to Plasmodium falciparum with engineered symbiotic bacteria</u>
Washington Post: <u>Genetically modified approaches to fighting malaria succeed in new tests</u>

#### CRISPR-Cas9 used to create genetic diversity in important yield-related traits in tomato

- The approach involved using CRISPR-Cas9 to generate an array of random mutations in the promoters of key yield genes
- After the CRISPR-Cas9 transgene was segregated away, the researchers could then characterize the mutations and traits
- The researchers hope this technique can help generate valuable genetic diversity in key traits in elite lines of additional crops

Cell: Engineering Quantitative Trait Variation for Crop Improvement by Genome Editing
Phys.org: Plant geneticists develop a new application of CRISPR to break yield barriers in crops

## DuPont-Pioneer's "Plenish" high-oleic soybean associated with decreased obesity in mice

- High oleic soybean oil was compared to conventional soybean oil, coconut oil, and a low-fat diet
- The study examined proteins in livers

Scientific Reports: Omega-6 and omega-3 oxylipins are implicated in soybean oil-induced obesity in mice GEN: GMO-Sourced Soybean Oil Causes Less Obesity than Conventional Oil

## Low-gliadin wheat developed using CRISPR/Cas to make wheat safe for celiac patients

• One line had mutations in 35 out of 45 gliadin loci and had 85% lower immunoreactivity Plant Biotechnology Journal: Low-gluten, non-transgenic wheat engineered with CRISPR/Cas9 Quartz: Scientists are close to creating a strain of GMO wheat without gluten

#### Sugarcane edited using TALENs for improved saccharaficiation efficiency

• The TALENs created mutations in 107 of the 109 COMT alleles

Plant Biotechnology Journal: TALEN mediated targeted mutagenesis of more than 100 COMT copies/alleles in highly polyploid sugarcane improves saccharification efficiency without compromising biomass yield

#### Wayne Parrott and Monsanto scientists explain how seed companies vet new plant varieties

Crop Science: Bringing New Plant Varieties to Market: Plant Breeding and Selection Practices Advance Beneficial Characteristics while Minimizing Unintended Changes

## Wayne Parrot and Miguel Sánchez refute studies cited in arguments against safety of GE food

Plant Biotechnology Journal: Characterization of scientific studies usually cited as evidence of adverse effects of GM food/feed

#### Bt tomato developed with resistance to tomato leaf miner

The tomato was developed in Turkey and expresses Cry1Ac

Plant Cell, Tissue and Organ Culture: Cry1Ac-mediated resistance to tomato leaf miner (Tuta absoluta) in tomato

## Rice expressing ion transporters from Jerusalem Artichoke have improved tolerance to salinity and nutrient stress

• The engineered rice plants had improved yield in field trials under K-limited salt-stress or nutrient deficient conditions

Plant Biotechnology Journal: Two NHX-type transporters from Helianthus tuberosus improve the tolerance of rice to salinity and nutrient deficiency stress

## Lettuce engineered for resistance to whitefly using RNAi

- The dsRNA target's a whitefly v-ATPase gene
- The lettuce was developed by Embrapa in Brazil

Transgenic Research: RNAi-mediated resistance to whitefly (Bemisia tabaci) in genetically engineered lettuce (Lactuca sativa)

## Apple engineered for drought tolerance

• The apples express endogenous *ATG18a*, which modulates the cellular process known as autophagy *Plant Biotechnology Journal:* Improvement of drought tolerance by overexpressing MdATG18a is mediated by modified antioxidant system and activated autophagy in transgenic apple

This report is a summary of third-party news, opinion, and scientific literature and is not meant to reflect views of the author or of the U.S. Food & Drug Administration.

For U.S. Government use only

#### Patrick Cournoyer, Ph.D.

Consumer Safety Officer

Center for Food Safety and Applied Nutrition Office of Food Additive Safety U.S. Food and Drug Administration Tel: 240-402-1019 patrick.cournoyer@fda.hhs.gov











